


APPEAL,APPEAL_NAT


**U.S. District Court
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS (Laredo)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 5:20-cv-00128
Internal Use Only**


Texas Alliance for Retired Americans et al v. Hughs
Assigned to: Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Christopher dos Santos
Related Case: [5:20-cv-00035](#)
Cause: 42:1983 Civil Rights Act


Date Filed: 08/12/2020
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 441 Civil Rights: Voting
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff**Texas Alliance for Retired Americans**represented by **Bruce Spiva**


Perkins Coie LLP
700 13th St NW
Suite 800
Washington, DC 20005
202-654-6200 
Email: bspiva@perkinscoie.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED


Daniel Osher
Perkins Coie LLP
700 13th St NW
Suite 800
Washington, DC 20005
202-654-6200 
Email: dosher@perkinscoie.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Emily Brailey
Perkins Coie LLP
700 13th St NW
Suite 800
Washington, DC 20005
202-654-6211 
Email: ebrailey@perkinscoie.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lalitha Madduri
Perkins Coie LLP
700 13th Street NW
Suite 800
Washington, DC 20005
202-654-6200 

Email: lmadduri@perkinscoie.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marc Elias
Perkins Coie LLP
700 13th St NW
Suite 800
Washington, DC 20005
202-654-6200 
Email: melias@perkinscoie.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Skyler Michelle Howton
Perkins Coie LLP
500 N. Akard Street
Suite 3300
Dallas, TX 75201
214-259-4951 
Fax: 214-965-7752 
Email: showton@perkinscoie.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Sylvia Bruni

represented by **Bruce Spiva**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Daniel Osher
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Emily Brailey
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lalitha Madduri
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marc Elias
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Skyler Michelle Howton
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

DSCC

represented by **Bruce Spiva**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Daniel Osher
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Emily Brailey
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lalitha Madduri
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marc Elias
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Skyler Michelle Howton
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff**DCCC**

represented by **Bruce Spiva**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Daniel Osher
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Emily Brailey
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lalitha Madduri
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marc Elias
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Skyler Michelle Howton
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.


Defendant**Ruth Hughs***in her official capacity as the Texas
Secretary of State*represented by **Todd Lawrence Disher**

Office of the Attorney General of Texas

209 W 14th St

8th Floor

Austin, TX 78701

512-936-0677 

Email: todd.disher@oag.texas.gov


LEAD ATTORNEY**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED****William Thomas Thompson**

Office of the Attorney General

Special Litigation Unit

P.O. Box 12548 (MC-076)

Austin, TX 78711-2548

512-936-2567 

Email: will.thompson@oag.texas.gov


ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
08/12/2020	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Ruth Hughs (Filing fee \$ 400 receipt number 0541-25054762) filed by DCCC, Sylvia Bruni, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 - Declaration of John Oldham, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 - Declaration of Dr. Muer Yang, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3 - Declaration of Dr. Catherine Troisi, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4 - Declaration of Dr. Allan Lichtman, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5 - Declaration of Maxwell Palmer, PhD, # <u>6</u> Civil Cover Sheet)(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 08/12/2020)
08/12/2020	<u>2</u>	Request for Issuance of Summons as to Ruth Hughs, filed.(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 08/12/2020)
08/12/2020	<u>3</u>	CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed.(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 08/12/2020)
08/12/2020	<u>4</u>	MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/2/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 08/12/2020)
08/12/2020	<u>5</u>	MOTION for Preliminary Injunction by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/2/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 08/12/2020)

08/12/2020	<u>6</u>	MEMORANDUM in Support re: <u>5</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix I to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>2</u> Appendix II to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>3</u> Appendix III to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>4</u> Appendix IV to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>5</u> Appendix V to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>6</u> Appendix VI to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>7</u> Appendix VII to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>8</u> Appendix VIII to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>9</u> Appendix IX to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>10</u> Appendix X to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>11</u> Appendix XI to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>12</u> Appendix XII to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>13</u> Appendix XIII to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>14</u> Appendix XIV to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>15</u> Appendix XV to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction)(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 08/12/2020)
08/13/2020		Summons Issued as to Ruth Hughs. Issued summons delivered to plaintiff by First-class mail, filed.(dmorales, 5) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/13/2020	<u>7</u>	ORDER Granting <u>4</u> MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages. It is so ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified. (mmarquez, 5) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/13/2020	<u>8</u>	ORDER, Given that Plaintiffs Motion for Preliminary Injunction is time-sensitive they ask the Court for an injunction to occur before the November 2020 election the Court hereby ORDERS Plaintiffs to file an Advisory as soon as possible to apprise the Court of the status of service of process on Defendant. (Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified. (atreveno, 5) Modified on 8/13/2020 (atreveno, 5). (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/13/2020	<u>9</u>	MOTION for Marc Elias to Appear Pro Hac ViceMotions referred to John A Kazen. by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/3/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Attachment A)(Elias, Marc) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/13/2020	<u>10</u>	MOTION for Lalitha Madduri to Appear Pro Hac ViceMotions referred to John A Kazen. by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/3/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Attachment A)(Madduri, Lalitha) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/13/2020	<u>11</u>	MOTION for Bruce V. Spiva to Appear Pro Hac ViceMotions referred to John A Kazen. by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/3/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Attachment A)(Spiva, Bruce) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/13/2020	<u>12</u>	MOTION for Daniel Osher to Appear Pro Hac ViceMotions referred to John A Kazen. by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired

		Americans, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/3/2020. (Attachments: # 1 Attachment A)(Osher, Daniel) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/13/2020	13	MOTION for Emily Brailey to Appear Pro Hac ViceMotions referred to John A Kazen. by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/3/2020. (Attachments: # 1 Attachment A)(Brailey, Emily) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/13/2020	14	ORDER OF RECUSAL. Magistrate Judge John A. Kazen hereby recuses himself in this case. Case reassigned to Magistrate Judge Diana Song Quiroga. (Signed by Magistrate Judge John A Kazen) Parties notified. (JessicaGRodriguez, 5) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/13/2020	15	ADVISORY by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed.(Spiva, Bruce) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/18/2020	16	RETURN of Service of SUMMONS Executed as to Ruth Hughs served on 8/18/2020, answer due 9/8/2020, filed.(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 08/18/2020)
08/19/2020	17	ORDER. Plaintiffs have filed a Motion for Preliminary Injunction (Dkt. No. 5).Defendant is ORDERED to respond to the motion by September 2, 2020. Plaintiffs may file a reply by September 7, 2020. (Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified.(ehernandez, 5) (Entered: 08/19/2020)
08/19/2020	18	ORDER granting 9 Motion for Marc E. Elias to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified.(ehernandez, 5) (Entered: 08/19/2020)
08/19/2020	19	ORDER granting 11 Motion for Bruce V. Spiva to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified.(ehernandez, 5) (Entered: 08/19/2020)
08/19/2020	20	ORDER granting 12 Motion for Daniel Osher to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified.(ehernandez, 5) (Entered: 08/19/2020)
08/19/2020	21	ORDER granting 13 Motion for Emily Brailey to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified.(ehernandez, 5) (Entered: 08/19/2020)
08/19/2020	22	ORDER granting 10 Motion for Lalitha D. Madduri to Appear Pro Hac Vice.(Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified. (ehernandez, 5) (Entered: 08/19/2020)
08/31/2020	23	NOTICE of Appearance by Todd Lawrence Disher on behalf of Ruth Hughs, filed. (Disher, Todd) (Entered: 08/31/2020)
08/31/2020	24	NOTICE of Appearance by William T. Thompson on behalf of Ruth Hughs, filed. (Thompson, William) (Entered: 08/31/2020)
08/31/2020	25	Unopposed MOTION for Leave to File Excess PagesMotions referred to

		Diana Song Quiroga. by Ruth Hughs, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/21/2020. (Attachments: # 1 Proposed Order)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 08/31/2020)
08/31/2020	26	MOTION to Dismiss 1 Complaint, by Ruth Hughs, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/21/2020. (Attachments: # 1 Proposed Order)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 08/31/2020)
09/02/2020	27	MOTION to Strike <i>Expert Declaration and Testimony of Dr. Allan Lichtman</i> Motions referred to Diana Song Quiroga. by Ruth Hughs, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/23/2020. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1, # 2 Proposed Order)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/02/2020)
09/02/2020	28	MOTION for Leave to File Excess PagesMotions referred to Diana Song Quiroga. by Ruth Hughs, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/23/2020. (Attachments: # 1 Proposed Order)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/02/2020)
09/02/2020	29	RESPONSE in Opposition to 5 MOTION for Preliminary Injunction, filed by Ruth Hughs. (Attachments: # 1 Proposed Order)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/02/2020)
09/02/2020	30	APPENDIX re: 29 Response in Opposition to Motion by Ruth Hughs, filed. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1, # 2 Exhibit 2, # 3 Exhibit 3, # 4 Exhibit 4, # 5 Exhibit 5, # 6 Exhibit 6, # 7 Exhibit 7, # 8 Exhibit 8, # 9 Exhibit 9, # 10 Exhibit 10, # 11 Exhibit 11, # 12 Exhibit 12, # 13 Exhibit 13, # 14 Exhibit 14, # 15 Exhibit 15, # 16 Exhibit 16, # 17 Exhibit 17, # 18 Exhibit 18, # 19 Exhibit 19, # 20 Exhibit 20, # 21 Exhibit 21, # 22 Exhibit 22, # 23 Exhibit 23, # 24 Exhibit 24, # 25 Exhibit 25, # 26 Exhibit 26, # 27 Exhibit 27, # 28 Exhibit 28)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/02/2020)
09/03/2020	31	NOTICE of Filing of Correction to Exhibit 4 of Appendix in Support re: 29 Response in Opposition to Motion by Ruth Hughs, filed. (Attachments: # 1 Corrected Exhibit 4, Part I of Appendix in Support, # 2 Corrected Exhibit 4, Part II of Appendix in Support)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/03/2020)
09/07/2020	32	MOTION for Leave to File Excess PagesMotions referred to Diana Song Quiroga. by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/28/2020. (Attachments: # 1 Proposed Order)(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 09/07/2020)
09/07/2020	33	RESPONSE in Opposition to 26 MOTION to Dismiss 1 Complaint, , filed by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans. (Attachments: # 1 Appendix I to Plaintiffs' Response in Opposition to Defendant's Motion to Dismiss)(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 09/07/2020)
09/07/2020	34	REPLY in Support of 5 MOTION for Preliminary Injunction, filed by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans. (Attachments: # 1 Appendix I - to Plaintiffs' Reply in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # 2 Appendix II - to Plaintiffs' Reply in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Preliminary Injunction)(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 09/07/2020)

09/08/2020	35	RESPONSE in Opposition to 27 MOTION to Strike <i>Expert Declaration and Testimony of Dr. Allan Lichtman</i> , filed by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Lichtman Deposition Transcript)(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 09/08/2020)
09/11/2020	36	ORDER granting 25 28 32 Motions for Leave to File Excess Pages.(Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified.(dmorales, 5) (Entered: 09/11/2020)
09/14/2020	37	NOTICE of Supplemental Authority by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. (Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 09/14/2020)
09/14/2020	38	REPLY in Support of 26 MOTION to Dismiss 1 Complaint, , filed by Ruth Hughs. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/14/2020)
09/14/2020	39	MOTION to Strike <i>Declaration of Dan Wallach or, in the Alternative, for Leave to File a Sur-Reply</i> Motions referred to Diana Song Quiroga. by Ruth Hughs, filed. Motion Docket Date 10/5/2020. (Attachments: # 1 Proposed Order)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/14/2020)
09/16/2020		(Court only) ***Case reassigned to Magistrate Judge Christopher dos Santos. Magistrate Judge Diana Song Quiroga no longer assigned to the case. (vcantu, 5) (Entered: 09/16/2020)
09/16/2020	40	RESPONSE in Opposition to 39 MOTION to Strike <i>Declaration of Dan Wallach or, in the Alternative, for Leave to File a Sur-Reply</i> , filed by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans. (Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 09/16/2020)
09/23/2020	41	REPLY in Support of 39 MOTION to Strike <i>Declaration of Dan Wallach or, in the Alternative, for Leave to File a Sur-Reply</i> , filed by Ruth Hughs. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/23/2020)
09/25/2020	42	ORDER denying Defendant's 27 Motion to Strike Dr. Lichtman's declaration and any future testimony.(Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified.(dmorales, 5) (Entered: 09/25/2020)
09/25/2020	43	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER granting in part and denying in part Defendant's 26 MOTION to Dismiss; denying 39 MOTION to Strike the Declaration of Dan Wallach; granting Plaintiff's 5 Request for Preliminary Injunction. (Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified. (dmorales, 5) (Entered: 09/25/2020)
09/26/2020	44	NOTICE OF APPEAL to US Court of Appeals for the Fifth Circuit re: 43 Memorandum and Order, by Ruth Hughs (Filing fee \$ 505, receipt number 0541-25264681), filed.(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/26/2020)
09/26/2020	45	Opposed MOTION to Stay <i>Preliminary Injunction</i> Motions referred to Christopher dos Santos. by Ruth Hughs, filed. Motion Docket Date 10/19/2020. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Bexar Co. Declaration, # 2 Exhibit

		Hays Co. Declaration, # 3 Exhibit Tarrant Co. Declaration, # 4 Exhibit Collin Co. Declaration, # 5 Proposed Order)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/26/2020)
--	--	--